Running head: Instructional Design Models

Compare and Contrast Three Instructional Design Models

Melody Jo Buckner

NAU ETC 667

Running head: Instructional Design Models

Instructional Design Models

An instructional design model gives the guidelines for developing a strategy that analyzes the learners' goals and develops a delivery system to achieve the goals. It basically provides the procedural blueprint for a systematic construction of instruction. These models are based on learning theories, which describe ways that people learn ideas or gain knowledge. Models help to visualize the overall process and break it down into smaller manageable components. There are many instructional design models focusing on different theories. This paper is going to compare and contrast three of those instructional design models. They are: 1) Gagne-Briggs Model, 2) Dick and Carey Design Model and 3) Gerlach and Ely Model.

Gagne-Briggs

Gagne-Briggs Model requires categorizing learning outcomes and organizes instructional events for the different kinds of learning outcomes. There are nine events: 1) gain attention, 2) inform learner of objective, 3) stimulate recall, 4) present the content, 5) provide learning guidance, 6) practice, 7) provide feedback, 8) assess performance, and 9) enhance retention. These events are assigned activities and interaction that will promote the desired outcome. The model is very simple and focused on the analysis of the learner. It used a set sequence that ensures the learner will achieve the desired goal. It is a good model for web-based instruction. However, some classroom teachers may have trouble with the language that is presented in this model. Another weakness in this model is that this time and task-focused model do not consider the characteristics of the learner.

Running head: Instructional Design Models

Dick and Carey Design Model

Dick and Carey Design Model utilize a systems approach for the design of instruction. It is similar to how software is programmed for a computer. This model describes all of the phases starting with goals and ending with a summary evaluation. All levels of designers (novice to expert) can use this model and it can be used in many learning environment (K-12 to business). It is a model that centers on the learner, but very linear in nature. It is a good model to use for web-based instruction. One drawback on this model is that behavior is not considered.

Gerlach and Ely Model

The Gerlach and Ely Model is based on strategies that deal with the selection of media within instruction. Allocation of resources is also covered in this model. This model systematically steps through a process. It starts with the specification of content and objectives, and then measures the students' present skill level. The next steps include the determination of strategy, the organization of groups, the allocation of time and space and the selection of resources. The model ends with the evaluation of performance and analysis of feedback. This model is easy for teachers to understand because they can identify with the process. They recognize the classifications of this model. However, this could inhibit them changing their learning and teaching strategies.

Compare and Contrast

To compare and contrast these models, I set up the table shown below. The classifications are described as follows: 1) Level - is this model designed for the novice or expert, 2) Orientation - is this model descriptive (describes a learning environment) or prescriptive (outlines changes for the learning environment), 3) Knowledge Structure - is

this model procedural (examples and practice) or declarative (analogies and discovery), 4) Target- who is the intended audience for this model, 5) Purpose- is this model better for small or large scale instruction, and 6) Theoretical Basis- is this model based on learning theory or systems theory.

Classifications	**Gagne and Briggs**	**Dick and Carey**	**Gerlach and Ely**
Level	Novice	Novice and Expert	Novice
Orientation	Descriptive	Descriptive	Prescriptive
Structure	Procedural	Procedural	Procedural
Target	Multimedia and Web-based	Web-based	K-12/Higher
Purpose	Large Scale	Small Scale	Small Scale
Theoretical Basis	Systems	Systems	Systems

Conclusion

I picked these three models for several different reasons. The first is I wanted to look at the most popular models used in instructional design. Second, I chose ones that were mainly for the novice or that were easy to follow. And lastly, I was looking at models that worked well for higher education and the web-based learning environment. After studying these models I feel that my style of teaching leans toward the Gagne and Briggs model. It is simply constructed and easy for me to follow. I like this model because it is linear. I am the type of instructor that likes to follow a pattern. I use this model in teaching in my Introduction to Computers class. Many computer programmers use the procedural approach to solve problems and write code. Maybe I teach this way because I understand this approach. I get it and I hope my students do, too!

Running head: Instructional Design Models

References

http://venus.uwindsor.ca/courses/edfac/morton/instructional_design.htm

http://www.umich.edu/~ed626/Gerlach_Ely/ge_main.htm

http://www.dean.usma.edu/math/activities/cape/Instructional_Models/id_models.html

http://www.geneed.com/technology/instr_design.html

http://www.geneed.com/technology/instr_design.html